

Supergravity on $AdS_{5/4} \times$ Hopf Fibrations and Conformal Field Theories

EDI HALYO^{*}

Department of Physics
Stanford University
Stanford, CA 94305

ABSTRACT

We obtain three and four dimensional conformal field theories with less than maximal supersymmetry by using their supergravity duals. These supergravity theories are type II on $AdS_5 \times CP^2$, IIA on $AdS_4 \times CP^3$, IIB on $AdS_5 \times S^5/Z_k$ and $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_4 \times S^7/Z_k$. They are obtained from the spherically compactified ten and eleven dimensional theories by either Hopf reduction or by winding the $U(1)$ fiber over the base.

^{*} e-mail address: halyo@dormouse.stanford.edu

1. Introduction

There has been great interest in the recently conjectured duality between supergravity on $AdS_{d+1} \times S^n$ and conformal field theories (CFT) living on the boundary of the AdS space which is the Minkowski space in d dimensions M_d [1-42]. By this duality the isometry groups of the AdS_{d+1} and S^n which are $SO(d, 2)$ and $SO(n + 1)$ become the conformal and R symmetries of the boundary theory. Since the spherical compactifications of supergravity are maximally supersymmetric the boundary superconformal field theory SCFT has sixteen supercharges. Moreover, there is a correspondence between the masses of bulk fields and the dimensions of the operators in the boundary SCFT[9]. For example, the tachyonic, massless and massive scalars correspond to relevant, marginal and irrelevant operators of the SCFT. The $AdS_{d+1} \times S^n$ geometry is also the near horizon geometry of nondilatonic branes of string and M theory, i.e. D3 branes of IIB, M2 and M5 branes. Thus, one can see the SCFT on the boundary as the large N world-volume theories of these branes. A nontrivial check of the conjecture is to match the dimensions of marginal and relevant operators in the SCFT to the masses of Kaluza-Klein towers of fields in the bulk supergravity. This was shown for the $AdS_5 \times S^5$ case in ref. [9] and for $AdS_{4/7} \times S^{7/4}$ in refs. [26,27,32,34]]. One can use this conjecture either to learn about SCFT by using the spherical compactifications of supergravity or to learn about nonperturbative aspects of string theory on AdS spacetimes by using better understood SCFT.

Spherical compactifications of supergravity are maximally supersymmetric and therefore the boundary SCFT necessarily has sixteen supercharges. However, the conjecture is believed to hold for any supersymmetry. SCFT with less than sixteen supercharges have been investigated in refs. [17,22,28,37,39,42]]. In all these cases one reduces the supersymmetry by orbifolding the space transverse to the boundary or brane. This leaves the AdS part of the geometry intact resulting in a CFT. The S^n part of the geometry is orbifolded and depending on the orbifold one gets different CFT with different amounts of supersymmetry. In this paper, we obtain CFT with less than sixteen supercharges by considering the transverse space S^n to

be a Hopf fibration. This can only be done for the odd spheres S^5 and S^7 which are $U(1)$ fibrations over CP^2 and CP^3 respectively. We break supersymmetry either by reducing over the $U(1)$ fiber, i.e. by Hopf reduction or by considering multiple windings of the $U(1)$ over the base space, i.e. lens spaces.

The paper is organized as follows. In section 2, we review the aspects of Hopf fibrations, Hopf reductions and lens spaces that we need in the following. In section 3, we obtain three and four dimensional CFT with less than maximal supersymmetry with their global symmetries and marginal operators. This is done by Hopf reduction of the IIB supergravity on $AdS_5 \times S^5$ and $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_4 \times S^7$. In sections 4 and 5 we do the same for three and four dimensional CFT by considering the corresponding supergravities on lens spaces. Section 6 is our conclusion.

2. Hopf Reductions and Lens Spaces

Any odd sphere S^{2n+1} can be considered as a $U(1)$ fibration over CP^n . The metric of the sphere becomes[29]

$$d\Omega_{2n+1}^2 = d\Sigma_{2n}^2 + (dz + \mathcal{A})^2 \quad (1)$$

where $d\Sigma_{2n}$ is the Fubini–Study metric of the CP^n and the Kaluza–Klein vector potential $\mathcal{A}$ has field strength $\mathcal{F}$ given by $\mathcal{F} = 2J$ where J is the Kahler form on CP^n . The coordinate on the fiber is z and it has period 4π .

Now, both $AdS_5 \times S^5$ and $AdS_4 \times S^7$ can be written as Hopf fibrations by substituting eq. (1) into the metric instead of the spherical parts S^5 and S^7 . For the $AdS_5 \times S^5$ case the metric becomes (by taking S^5 to be a Hopf fibration over CP^2)

$$ds_{10}^2 = ds^2(AdS_5) + \frac{1}{m^2} d\Sigma_4^2 + \frac{1}{m^2} (dz + \mathcal{A})^2 \quad (2)$$

where $1/m^2$ is the radius of the sphere and the AdS space related to the cosmological constant of the AdS space and $d\Sigma_4^2$ is the metric on CP^2 . Since

$\Omega_5 = (dz + \mathcal{A}) \wedge \Sigma_4$ one can reduce the ten dimensional metric on the $U(1)$ fiber and get a nine dimensional metric[29]

$$ds_9^2 = ds^2(AdS_5) + \frac{1}{m^2} d\Sigma_4^2 \quad (3)$$

This metric is a solution of the equations of motion of the $D = 9$ type II supergravity obtained from the $D = 10$ IIB theory by Hopf reduction. (The solution also involves the dilaton and the five form in addition to the metric but they are not relevant to our discussion.) Thus, it describes type II supergravity on $AdS_5 \times CP^2$. We are interested in the massless fields in the bulk since supersymmetry and the gauge group are determined by the number of massless gravitini and massless gauge bosons. These in turn determine the supersymmetry and R symmetry of the boundary SCFT. In addition, massless scalars correspond to marginal operators in the boundary SCFT. The massless spectrum in the bulk of the $D = 9$ theory will be a truncation of that of the $D = 10$ theory. The isometry of S^5 (R symmetry of the SCFT) $SU(4)$ is reduced to $SU(3) \times U(1)$ which is the isometry of $U(1) \times CP^2$. The massless spectrum in the $D = 9$ theory given by the subset of the massless spectrum of $D = 10$ theory which are zero modes of this reduction, i.e. they are neutral under the Kaluza–Klein gauge field $U(1)$. As a result, the Hopf reduction will change the supersymmetry, gauge symmetry and massless matter content of the bulk theory or equivalently the supersymmetry, R symmetry and marginal operators of the four dimensional boundary SCFT.

The $AdS^4 \times S^7$ case is very similar[48]. Now S^7 is described as a $U(1)$ fibration over CP^3 and one can Hopf reduce the $D = 11$ supergravity metric for the $AdS_4 \times S^7$ over the fiber. This is a solution of $D = 10$ IIA theory and describes IIA on $AdS_4 \times CP^3$. The isometry of S^7 which is $SO(8)$ is reduced to the isometry of $U(1) \times CP^3$ which is $U(1) \times SU(4)$. Again truncating to the $U(1)$ neutral sector gives the supersymmetry, R symmetry and marginal operators of the three dimensional boundary SCFT.

Another way of getting SCFT with less than sixteen supercharges is to consider supergravity on AdS times a lens space denoted by S^{2n+1}/Z_k . These are obtained

by identifying the fiber coordinate of the $U(1)$ over CP^n with a period $1/k$ times that in the S^{2n+1} case[29]. These lens spaces are equivalent to orbifolds of the space transverse to the boundary. This can be seen by describing S^{2n+1} by a unit sphere in C^{n+1} with complex coordinates z_i , $i = 1, \dots, n+1$. Then the orbifold $z_i \rightarrow e^{i\alpha} z_i$ with $\alpha = 2\pi/k$ is precisely the lens space S^{2n+1}/Z_k . Again only a subset of the original states on S^{2n+1} will remain in the massless spectrum of S^{2n+1}/Z_k . These will be states with $U(1)$ charge[29]

$$q = \frac{1}{2}kn \quad (4)$$

where n is any integer and k is given by the Z_k winding. Since all gravitini, gauge bosons and scalars of the theory on the sphere carry fixed charges under $U(1)$ different lens spaces (i.e. different k) will result in different supersymmetry, R symmetry and marginal operators for the three and four dimensional SCFT.

3. Hopf Reduced Supergravity and Conformal Field Theories

In this section we find the massless spectrum of $D = 9$ type II supergravity on $AdS_5 \times CP^2$ and of $D = 10$ IIA supergravity on $AdS_4 \times CP^3$. As explained above, we get these by Hopf reducing $D = 10$ IIB supergravity on $AdS_5 \times S^5$ [30,31] and $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_4 \times S^7$. Using the conjectured duality between supergravity on AdS spacetime and SCFT on the boundary these will give us four and three dimensional SCFT with less than maximal supersymmetry.

Consider first $D = 10$ IIB supergravity on $AdS_5 \times S^5$ [43]. The isometry group of $AdS_5 \times S^5$ is $SO(4, 2) \times SU(4)$ where the first factor is the conformal symmetry of the four dimensional boundary theory and the second factor is the R symmetry. From the point of view of the bulk $SU(4)$ is the gauge symmetry of the gauged supergravity with maximal ($\mathcal{N} = 8$) supersymmetry. Therefore, there are eight gravitini in the $4 + \bar{4}$ and fifteen gauge bosons in the 15 representations of $SU(4)$. In addition, there are massless scalars in the bulk in the representations 1, 45 and 105 which correspond to marginal operators. In order to find out which of these

remain in the massless spectrum after Hopf reduction we need to know the way these representation decompose under the gauge symmetry of the $D = 9$ theory $SU(3) \times U(1)$

$$1 \rightarrow 1_0 \tag{5a}$$

$$4 \rightarrow 3_{-1/2} + 1_{3/2} \tag{5b}$$

$$\bar{4} \rightarrow \bar{3}_{1/2} + 1_{-3/2} \tag{5c}$$

$$15 \rightarrow 1_0 + 8_0 + 3_{-2} + \bar{3}_2 \tag{5d}$$

$$45 \rightarrow 3_4 + \bar{3}_2 + 6_2 + 8_0 + 10_0 + 15_{-2} \tag{5e}$$

$$105 \rightarrow 15'_4 + \bar{15}'_{-4} + 24_{-2} + \bar{24}_2 + 27_0 \tag{5f}$$

where the subscript denotes the $U(1)$ charges of the states. (The normalization of the charges is chosen to agree with supergravity literature.) Only the states neutral under the $U(1)$ remain in the massless spectrum after Hopf reduction. We see that none of the gravitini remain so that there is no unbroken supersymmetry. Of the gauge bosons only $1_0 + 8_0$ is left which means that the gauge group is now $SU(3) \times U(1)$, precisely the group we expect from the isometry of the $D = 9$ theory. Among the scalars the remaining ones are in the representations $1_0 + 8_0 + 10_0 + 27_0$.

Using the conjectured duality between supergravity on AdS spaces and CFT on the boundary we find that this describes a $D = 4$, $\mathcal{N} = 0$ CFT with a global $SU(3) \times U(1)$ symmetry and four marginal operators in the $1_0 + 8_0 + 10_0 + 27_0$ representations.

Now we consider the second case which is $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_4 \times S^7$ [44-46]. The isometry group is $SO(3, 2) \times SO(8)$ where the first factor is the conformal symmetry of the $2 + 1$ dimensional boundary theory and the second one is the R symmetry. From the bulk point of view $SO(8)$ is the gauge symmetry of the gauged supergravity with maximal supersymmetry. Thus we have gravitini in one of the three representations $8_v, 8_s, 8_c$ (alternatively the gravitini are in the 8_s but there are three embeddings of $SU(4) \times U(1)$ in $SO(8)$) and gauge bosons in the 28.

The massless scalars and pseudoscalars are in the 35_v and 35_s for $8_{v,c}$ gravitini. However for 8_s gravitini the scalars and pseudoscalars are both in the 35_v . The decomposition of these under $SU(4) \times U(1)$ is

$$8_v \rightarrow 4_1 + \bar{4}_1 \quad (6a)$$

$$8_s \rightarrow 1_2 + 1_{-2} + 6_0 \quad (6b)$$

$$8_c \rightarrow 4_{-1} + \bar{4}_1 \quad (6c)$$

$$28 \rightarrow 1_0 + 6_2 + 6_{-2} + 15_0 \quad (6d)$$

$$35_v \rightarrow 10_2 + \bar{10}_{-2} + 15_0 \quad (6e)$$

$$35_s \rightarrow 1_0 + 1_4 + 1_{-4} + 6_2 + 6_{-2} + 20'_s \quad (6f)$$

$$35_c \rightarrow 10_2 + \bar{10}_{-2} + 15_0 \quad (6g)$$

Again only the states neutral under the $U(1)$ remain after Hopf reduction. There are three cases which correspond to the three possible representations of the gravitini. The v and c cases are identical and we consider them first. In this case, we find that there are no gravitini left so that there is no supersymmetry in the bulk. The gauge group is broken down to $SU(4) \times U(1)$ since the remaining gauge bosons are in $1_0 + 15_0$. The only remaining scalars (pseudoscalars) are in 15_0 (1_0). This is the massless spectrum of IIA supergravity on $AdS_4 \times CP^3$. The corresponding boundary theory is a $D = 3$, $\mathcal{N} = 0$ CFT with global $SU(4) \times U(1)$ symmetry and two marginal operators in the $1_0 + 15_0$.

Next we consider the other case with the gravitini in the 8_s . We see that in this case there are six gravitini in the 6_0 which remain in the spectrum. Therefore there is $\mathcal{N} = 6$ supersymmetry in the bulk. The gauge group is again $SU(4) \times U(1)$. The only massless scalars (and pseudoscalars) are in the 15_0 . On the boundary this gives a $D = 3$, $\mathcal{N} = 6$ SCFT with R symmetry $SU(4) \times U(1)$ and two marginal operators in the 15_0 .

4. IIB Supergravity on $AdS_5 \times$ Lens Space

In this section, we consider IIB supergravity on $AdS_5 \times S^5/Z_k$ [29] where the second factor denotes a lens space described in section 2. The winding of the $U(1)$ fiber over CP^2 is another way of breaking supersymmetry and the gauge group of the bulk theory. This happens because only a subset of the states of IIB supergravity on $AdS_5 \times S^5$ survive the charge condition given in eq. (4). As mentioned previously, different winding numbers k will result in different supersymmetries and gauge groups. For concreteness we consider the cases with $k = 2, 3$ explicitly and make some general observations about the cases with larger k .

$k = 2$: In this case, the charge condition for the surviving states is $q = n$ where n is any integer. We find that all gravitini are projected out so that there is no supersymmetry. The gauge group in the bulk becomes $SU(3) \times SU(2)^2 \times U(1)$ since all gauge bosons remain in the spectrum but in the representations $1_0 + 3_{-2} + 3_2 + 8_0$. All the massless scalars also remain but are now decomposed into 1_0 the singlet, $3_4 + \bar{3}_2 + 6_2 + 8_0 + 10_0 + 15_{-2}$ coming from the 45 and $15'_4 + \bar{15}'_{-4} + 24_{-2} + \bar{24}_2 + 27_0$ coming from the 105. By the duality this corresponds to a $D = 4$, $\mathcal{N} = 0$ CFT with a global $SU(3) \times SU(2)^2 \times U(1)$ group and thirteen marginal operators in the representations given above.

$k = 3$: Now only states with $q = 3n/2$ survive. As a result, there are two remaining gravitini giving $\mathcal{N} = 2$ supersymmetry in the bulk. The gauge group is $SU(3) \times U(1)$ and the remaining scalars are in the 1_0 , $8_0 + 10_0$ and 27_0 representations. On the boundary this gives a $D = 4$, $\mathcal{N} = 1$ SCFT with four marginal operators. This is exactly the same SCFT obtained in ref. [17,42] by orbifolding the the space transverse to the D3 branes.

By now it is easy to see some general features of the boundary CFT depending on the winding number k . We see that for $k > 3$ all gravitini are projected out so that these lead to four dimensional CFT without supersymmetry. For $k = 4$ the gauge group is $SU(3) \times SU(2)^2 \times U(1)$ whereas for $k > 4$ it is $SU(3) \times U(1)$. Four marginal operators always survive since there are three massless scalars with vanishing $U(1)$ charge: the singlet 1_0 , $8_0 + 10_0$ coming from the 45 and 27_0 coming

from the 105.

5. $D = 11$ Supergravity on $AdS \times$ Lens Space

In this section, we consider $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_4 \times$ lens space which we denote S^7/Z_k [47,48]. Now S^7 is taken to be a $U(1)$ fibration over CP^3 and k again denotes the winding of the fiber over the base. Again for different k we will find that different subsets of the massless sector of $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_4 \times S^7$ survive resulting in different CFT on the boundary. Below we consider the cases for $k = 2, 3$ explicitly and make some general observations about other $k > 3$.

$k = 2$: For $k = 2$ the cases with gravitini in 8_v (or 8_c) and 8_s lead to the same results. The charge condition is $q = n$ and we find that all gravitini remain in the spectrum and there is maximal supersymmetry in the bulk. We also find that all the gauge bosons remain in the spectrum; however the gauge group is broken down to $SU(4) \times SO(4)^2 \times U(1)$. In addition, all massless scalars (and pseudoscalars) remain but now in the $10_2 + \bar{10}_{-2} + 15_0$ (and $1_4 + 1_{-4} + 1_0 + 6_2 + 6_{-2} + 20'_s$) representation for the gravitini in $8_{v,c}$ case and both in the $10_2 + \bar{10}_{-2} + 15_0$ for the gravitini in the 8_s case. We find that none of the massless states are projected out for $k = 2$ since all $U(1)$ charges are integer in eq. (6). This leads on the boundary to $D = 3$, $\mathcal{N} = 8$ SCFT with the $SU(3) \times SO(4)^2 \times U(1)$ R symmetry.

$k = 3$: For $k = 3$ the charge condition is $q = 3n/2$ and there will be a difference between the two cases in which the gravitini belong to different representations. In the case of $8_{v,c}$ gravitini, all gravitini are projected out so that the bulk theory is not supersymmetric. The gauge group is $SU(4) \times U(1)$ in the bulk. The only remaining massless scalar (pseudoscalar) is in the 15_0 (1_0) representation. Thus we get on the boundary a $D = 3$ $\mathcal{N} = 0$ CFT with global $SU(4) \times U(1)$ symmetry and two marginal operators. In the case of 8_s gravitini, we find that six gravitini in the 6_0 remain so that there is $\mathcal{N} = 6$ supersymmetry in the bulk. The gauge group is exactly as in the other case but now both scalars and pseudoscalars are

in the 15_0 . This leads to a $D = 3$, $\mathcal{N} = 6$ SCFT with $SU(4) \times U(1)$ R symmetry with two marginal operators.

For larger k some general features emerge from the $U(1)$ charges given in eq. (6). We see that in the case of $8_{v,c}$ gravitini for $k > 3$ there is no supersymmetry whereas in the case of 8_s gravitini for $k = 4$ there is maximal supersymmetry and for $k > 4$ there is $\mathcal{N} = 6$ supersymmetry in the CFT. In both cases the global symmetry group is $SU(4) \times SO(4)^2 \times U(1)$ for $k = 4$ and $SU(4) \times U(1)$ for $k > 4$. We find that for all k there are at least two marginal operators either in 1_0 for $8_{v,c}$ gravitini or in 15_0 for 8_s gravitini. We find that for all k there are at least two marginal operators since $35_{v,c}$ includes 15_0 and 35_s includes 1_0 which cannot be projected out.

6. Conclusions

In this paper, we obtained four and three dimensional CFT with less than maximal supersymmetry using the conjectured duality between supergravity on AdS spaces and CFT on the boundary. We found the CFT dual to $D = 9$ type II supergravity on $AdS_5 \times CP^2$ and $D = 10$ IIA supergravity on $AdS_4 \times CP^3$. These were obtained by Hopf reduction of IIB on $AdS_5 \times S^5$ and $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_4 \times S^7$. The odd spheres $S^{5,7}$ were considered to be $U(1)$ fibrations over $CP^{2,3}$ and the theories were dimensionally reduced over the fiber. Clearly this method is only useful for spacetimes which contain an odd sphere. For example, this method cannot be applied to the third well-known case of $D = 11$ supergravity on $AdS_7 \times S^4$. We also considered CFT which are dual to $D = 11$ and IIB supergravity compactified on lens spaces where the $U(1)$ fiber is wound over the base CP^n k times. We saw that the number of supersymmetries, the global symmetry and the number of marginal operators in the boundary CFT depend on the winding number k .

We obtained a number of CFT with less than maximal or no supersymmetry in both three and four dimensions. In particular we were able to find nonsupersymmetric CFT fairly easily either by Hopf reduction or by winding the $U(1)$ fiber.

This is due to the fact that all gravitini have fixed and nonzero $U(1)$ charges and therefore in Hopf reduction and on most lens spaces they are projected out completely. We also found that all these CFT have marginal operators. The massless scalars decompose into states which include $U(1)$ neutral states which cannot be projected out. In this paper we were only interested in the marginal operators of the CFT which are related to the massless bulk fields in supergravity. However, one can easily do the same analysis for the tachyonic fields which will give the relevant operators in the CFT discussed above.

Even though we were able to find CFT with less than maximal supersymmetry by using the duality to supergravity on AdS spacetimes we could not check our results by direct knowledge of the CFT on the boundary. In particular we do not know a construction of these CFT by using D branes or M branes (except the S^5/Z_k case which is equivalent to orbifolded D3 brane theories). However, since the original supergravities are dual to world-volume theories of D3 or M2 branes before Hopf reduction or winding the fiber one expects that such a description is possible. It would be interesting to find these descriptions and explicitly check the conjectured duality in the cases considered in this paper.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Arvind Rajaraman and Eva Silverstein for very useful discussions.

REFERENCES

1. J. M. Maldacena, hep-th/9711200.
2. S. S. Gubser, I. R. Klebanov and A. W. Peet hep-th/9602135.
3. I. R. Klebanov, hep-th/9702076
4. S. S. Gubser, I. R. Klebanov and A. A. Tseytlin, hep-th/9703040.
5. S. S. Gubser and I. R. Klebanov, hep-th/9708005.
6. J. M. Maldacena and A. Strominger, hep-th/9710014.
7. A. M. Polyakov, hep-th/9711002.
8. S.S. Gubser, I.R. Klebanov and A.M. Polyakov, hep-th/9802109.
9. E. Witten, hep-th/9802150.
10. K. Sfetsos and K. Skenderis, hep-th/9711138.
11. R. Kallosh, J. Kumar and A. Rajaraman, hep-th/9712073
12. P. Claus, R. Kallosh, J. Kumar, P. Townsend and A. Van Proeyen, hep-th/9801206.
13. S. Ferrara and C. Fronsdal, hep-th/9712239.
14. N. Itzhaki, J. M. Maldacena, J. Sonnenschein and S. Yankielowicz, hep-th/9802042.
15. M. Gunaydin and D. Minic, hep-th/9802047.
16. G. T. Horowitz and H. Ooguri, hep-th/9802116.
17. S. Kachru and E. Silverstein, hep-th/9802183.
18. M. Berkooz, hep-th/9802195.
19. V. Balasubramanian and F. Larsen, hep-th/9802198.
20. J. M. Maldacena, hep-th/9803002.
21. M. Flato and C. Fronsdal, hep-th/9803013.

- 22. A. Lawrence, N. Nekrasov and C. Vafa, hep-th/9803015.
- 23. S. S. Gubser, A. Hashimoto, I. R. Klebanov and M. Krasnitz, hep-th/9803023.
- 24. L. Castellani, A. Ceresole, R. D'Auria, S. Ferrara, P. Fre' and M. Trgiant, hep-th/9803039.
- 25. S. Ferrara, C. Fronsda and A. Zaffaroni, hep-th/9802203.
- 26. O. Aharony, Y. Oz and Z. Yin, hep-th/9803051.
- 27. S Minwalla, hep-th/9803053.
- 28. S. Ferrara and A. Zaffaroni, hep-th/9803060.
- 29. M. Duff, H. Lu and C. Pope, hep-th/9803061.
- 30. L. Romans, Phys. Lett. B154 (1985) 392.
- 31. M. Gunaydin, L. Romans and N. Warner, Phys. Lett. B154 (1985) 268; Nucl. Phys. B272 (1985) 598.
- 32. R. Leigh and M. Rozali, hep-th/980368.
- 33. M. Bershadsky, Z. Kakushadze and C. Vafa, hep-th/9803076.
- 34. E. Halyo, hep-th/9803077.
- 35. A. Rajaraman, hep-th/9803082.
- 36. G. Horowitz and S. Ross, hep-th/9803085.
- 37. S. Ferrara, A. Kehagias, H. Partouche and A. Zaffaroni, hep-th/9803109.
- 38. J. Minahan, hep-th/9803111.
- 39. J. Gomis, hep-th/9803119.
- 40. E. Witten, hep-th/9803131.
- 41. M. Gunaydin, hep-th/9803138.
- 42. Y. Oz and J. Terning, hep-th/9803167.

- 43. H. J. Kim, L. J. Romans and P. van Nieuwenhuizen, Phys. Rev. D32 (1985) 389.
- 44. B. Biran, A. Casher, F. Englert, M. Roodman and P. Spindel, Phys. Lett. **134B** (1984) 179.
- 45. M. Gunaydin and N. P. Warner, Nucl. Phys. B272 (1986) 99-124.
- 46. A. Casher, F. Englert, H. Nicolai and M. Roodman, Nucl. Phys. B243 (1984) 173-188.
- 47. B. E. W. Nilsson and C. Pope, Class. Quant. Grav. 1 (1984) 499.
- 48. M. Duff, H. Lu and C. Pope, hep-th/9704186.